

# The Myth of Cost Savings from Private School Vouchers

When states establish or expand private school voucher programs, they set up two education systems based on public funding. Voucher programs are expensive, impractical, and educationally unsound, and they don't save money for anyone but the wealthy, who have likely already chosen private schools.

#### VOUCHERS ARE MORE EXPENSIVE THAN PUBLIC SCHOOLING

A 2018 study found the cost of educating a student through an Arizona private school voucher program was 75% higher than the cost of educating an Arizona public school student. Another study estimated that shifting to a system of private school vouchers could raise education costs by 25% or more when accounting for students who would have attended private schools without a voucher and the additional administrative costs for the program, such as record keeping and monitoring. A 2021 policy brief exploring the cost of implementing a large-scale, national voucher system estimated that universal vouchers could increase the total public cost of education by 11-33%, an increase of \$66-\$203 billion per year.

### VOUCHER PROGRAMS ARE EXPENSIVE TO OPERATE; FRAUD AND ABUSE BOOST COSTS FURTHER

Private school voucher programs have costs beyond the face value of the voucher, including record keeping, information dissemination, and dispute adjudication.<sup>4</sup> Even states with lax accountability systems in their voucher programs must set up and implement the program, disburse funds, and, on occasion, interface with private schools. When more robust accountability systems are in place, state education departments must monitor the use of voucher funds by families and private schools. Requiring states to monitor two separate education systems is an inefficient use of limited resources. Voucher programs become even more costly when factoring in waste and abuse. Examples of the misuse of public funds have been found in several states, including North Carolina, <sup>5</sup> Utah, <sup>6</sup> Wisconsin, <sup>7</sup> Arizona, <sup>8</sup> and Florida. <sup>9</sup> Moreover, the necessary audits and oversight to prevent and address such abuse consume additional public resources.

### • VOUCHERS SHIFT EDUCATION EXPENSES TO PARENTS

Whereas public schools provide transportation, special education services, and free or reduced-price lunches for qualifying students, these and other essential services must often be purchased separately by families using vouchers to attend private schools. This is in addition to the frequent need to "top up" the value of a voucher to cover the full cost of private school tuition.

The price tag of universal voucher programs is often significantly underestimated, resulting in programs that are vastly more expensive than initially promised. Public Funds Public Schools' advocacy tool allows users to estimate the potential price tag of a universal voucher program in any state.

## • VOUCHER PROGRAMS SUBSIDIZE PRIVATE EDUCATION FOR STUDENTS WHO WOULD NOT OTHERWISE HAVE ATTENDED PUBLIC SCHOOL

It is not true that voucher programs simply shift funds that would have been spent on public school students to pay for their private education. When states establish private school voucher programs, families already paying for or planning to use private education often participate.<sup>12</sup> In states where this information is available, the data shows that the vast majority of students who take vouchers never attended public schools, including: North Carolina (87%),<sup>13</sup> Oklahoma (91%),<sup>14</sup> Alabama (71%),<sup>15</sup> Iowa (60%),<sup>16</sup> Arizona (80%),<sup>17</sup> New Hampshire (89%),<sup>18</sup> Wisconsin (85%),<sup>19</sup> Arkansas (83)%,<sup>20</sup> Florida (70%),<sup>21</sup> and Indiana (70%).<sup>22</sup>

Many voucher laws permit participation by students who have not previously attended public school, and several states have established voucher programs without any eligibility criteria whatsoever.<sup>23</sup> It is wholly inaccurate to assume that students receiving a voucher switched from public to private education.<sup>24</sup>

#### VOUCHER PROGRAMS INCENTIVIZE PRIVATE SCHOOLS TO INCREASE THE COST OF TUITION

When states enact new voucher programs or increase the amount of a voucher offered through an existing program, private schools are incentivized to increase tuition. An analysis found that some private schools in Iowa increased tuition for the 2023-24 school year by nearly 40%, while others doubled tuition following passage of a universal education savings account (ESA) voucher program.<sup>25</sup> Another study of the Iowa voucher program found that the tuition increase was causally related to the voucher program.<sup>26</sup> In Arizona, a report found that nearly all private schools have raised tuition since 2022, with almost half increasing tuition by 10% or more, and in several cases by more than 20%.<sup>27</sup> In North Carolina, an analysis found that, on average, private schools raised tuition by about 15% the year following universal expansion of the state's voucher program compared to 2-8% on average in prior years. Many schools also adjusted their tuition to match the voucher amount.<sup>28</sup> Another analysis found that several rural private schools in North Carolina increased tuition for the 2024-25 school year between 20 and 50%.<sup>29</sup>

#### VOUCHER PROGRAMS DO NOT CHANGE FIXED COSTS IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Public schools, which serve the vast majority of the nation's students, have substantial "fixed costs." Because students who participate in voucher programs exit their public school districts from different schools, grade levels and classrooms, districts cannot proportionally reduce facilities, staff, programs, and other fixed costs to fully offset the loss of funding that is diverted to voucher programs.<sup>30</sup>

# • VOUCHER PROGAMS CONCENTRATE STUDENTS WHO REQUIRE INCREASED RESOURCES IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Because private schools can refuse to admit or provide adequate services for students with disabilities, English learners, and others who may require increased resources for an equitable education, these students are more frequently educated in public schools. Private schools participating in voucher programs may also "counsel out" or expel students they deem "high cost" or push out the lowest achieving voucher students. In other cases, families return their children to public schools when they realize they are not receiving the necessary services or supports, or are not entitled to the same legal protections, as in public schools. Public schools continue to require sufficient resources to serve students with additional needs, even when public funds are diverted from them to pay for vouchers.

### • INVESTING IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS IS MORE COST EFFECTIVE THAN VOUCHER PROGRAMS

Private school voucher programs threaten vital funding for public schools<sup>33</sup> but are not shown to improve students' academic outcomes.<sup>34</sup> Public funds should be used to invest in evidence-based and cost effective strategies that have been shown to increase student achievement,<sup>35</sup> such as expanding access to high-quality early childhood education,<sup>36</sup> reducing class sizes<sup>37</sup> and improving wrap-around services and enrichment opportunities, to name just a few examples. When we invest in public schools, all students and their communities have true opportunities to learn, grow, and thrive.

Public Funds Public Schools is a national campaign directed by Education Law Center that works to ensure public funds are used exclusively to support and strengthen our nation's public schools. pfps.org

- <sup>5</sup> Kris Nordstrom, *New analysis shows many private schools in N.C. have more vouchers than students*, North Carolina Justice Center (2023), <a href="https://www.ncjustice.org/analysis-nc-private-school-voucher-program/">https://www.ncjustice.org/analysis-nc-private-school-voucher-program/</a>; Ali Ingersoll, *SBI investigating fraud allegations against director of Selma private school*, WRAL News (July 7, 2023), <a href="https://www.wral.com/story/sbi-investigating-fraud-allegations-against-director-of-selma-privateschool/20944741/">https://www.wral.com/story/sbi-investigating-fraud-allegations-against-director-of-selma-privateschool/20944741/</a>.
- <sup>6</sup> Office of the State Auditor, *Utah State Board of Education, Limited Review For the Year Ending June 30, 2023,* Report No. 23-02 (2023), <a href="https://reporting.auditor.utah.gov/servlet/servlet.FileDownload?file=0151K000008NKuDQAW">https://reporting.auditor.utah.gov/servlet/servlet.FileDownload?file=0151K000008NKuDQAW</a>.
- <sup>7</sup> Jacon Ahrens-Balwit, *Private schools with no accreditation receive state funds*, The Badger Herald (Mar. 14, 2023), <a href="https://badgerherald.com/news/wisconsin/2013/03/14/private-schools-with/">https://badgerherald.com/news/wisconsin/2013/03/14/private-schools-with/</a>.
- <sup>8</sup> Kiera Riley, *More indictments related to voucher program come, Horne touts safeguards*, Arizona Capitol Times (Dec. 2, 2024), <a href="https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2024/12/02/more-indictments-related-to-voucher-program-come-horne-touts-safeguards/?emci=7fe5eade-8db5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840&ceid=4022232; Save Our Schools Arizona, *Bounce Houses? Espresso Machines? Home Gyms? ESA Vouchers are Being Used as a Taxpayer ATM* (Jan. 27, 2024),

  https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2024/12/02/more-indictments-related-to-voucher-program-come-horne-touts-safeguards/?emci=7fe5eade-8db5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840&ceid=4022232; Save Our Schools Arizona, *Bounce Houses? Espresso Machines? Home Gyms? ESA Vouchers are Being Used as a Taxpayer ATM* (Jan. 27, 2024),

 $\frac{https://azcapitoltimes.com/news/2024/12/02/more-indictments-related-to-voucher-program-come-horne-touts-safeguards/?emci=7fe5eade-8db5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=89cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-88d0-000d3a9d5840\&emdi=80cb07c3-95b5-ef11-$ 

- <sup>9</sup> Brianna LeCompte, *NEWS: Investigation Reveals That State-Funded School Vouchers Were Used for Over 8,400 Disney, Universal, and SeaWorld Tickets*, AllEars (May 31, 2025), <a href="https://allears.net/2025/05/31/investigation-reveals-that-state-funded-school-vouchers-were-used-for-over-8400-disney-universal-and-seaworld-tickets/">https://allears.net/2025/05/31/investigation-reveals-that-state-funded-school-vouchers-were-used-for-over-8400-disney-universal-and-seaworld-tickets/</a>.
- <sup>10</sup> National Center for Learning Disabilities, *Private School Vouchers, Education Savings Accounts, and Tax Incentive Programs* (2024), <a href="https://ncld.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/12/241219-Vouchers-Report 2024-Final.pdf">https://ncld.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/12/241219-Vouchers-Report 2024-Final.pdf</a>.

<sup>11</sup> See, e.g., id.

- <sup>12</sup> See, e.g., Henry M. Levin & Cyrus E. Drive, *Cost of an Educational Voucher System*, 5(3) Educ. Econ. 265 (1997), https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09645299700000023.
- <sup>13</sup> North Carolina State Board of Education Department of Public Instruction, Report to the North Carolina General Assembly, Opportunity Scholarships, § G.S. 115C-562.7(f) (June 1, 2025),

https://simbli.eboardsolutions.com/Meetings/Attachment.aspx?S=10399&AID=435803&MID=16935.

- <sup>14</sup> Oklahoma Tax Commission, *Parental Choice Tax Credit (PCTC) Report 70 O.S. § 28-101(K)* (May 1, 2025), https://oklahoma.gov/content/dam/ok/en/tax/documents/resources/reports/pctc/PCTC Report 5022025.pdf.
- <sup>15</sup> Anna Barrett, *Most CHOOSE Act recipients will stay in the same type of school with voucher-like credit*, Alabama Reflector (July 8, 2025), https://alabamareflector.com/2025/07/08/most-choose-act-recipients-will-stay-in-the-same-type-of-school-with-voucher-like-credit/.
- <sup>16</sup> Robin Opsahl, *More than 29,000 apply for lowa private-school fundings in first year*, lowa Capital Dispatch (July 6, 2023), https://iowacapitaldispatch.com/2023/07/06/more-than-29000-apply-for-iowa-private-school-funds-in-first-year/#:∵:text=Kim%20Reynolds%20announced%20Thursday.,first%20year%20of%20the%20program.
- <sup>17</sup> Eryka Forquer, *Applications for school vouchers at nearly 22,500 so far, Education Department says*, Arizona Republic (Oct. 7, 2022), <a href="https://www.azcentral.com/story/news/local/arizona-education/2022/10/07/arizona-school-vouchers-nearly-22-500-applications-pour-so-far/8208504001/">https://www.azcentral.com/story/news/local/arizona-education/2022/10/07/arizona-school-vouchers-nearly-22-500-applications-pour-so-far/8208504001/</a>.
- <sup>18</sup> Ethan Dewitt, *Most education freedom account recipients not leaving public schools, department says*, New Hampshire Bulletin (Mar. 28, 2022), <a href="https://newhampshirebulletin.com/briefs/most-education-freedom-account-recipients-not-leaving-public-schools-department-says/#:~:text=By%3A%20Ethan%20DeWitt%20%2DM2cMarch%2028%2C%202022%205%3A44%20pm&text=New%20Hampshire's%20Education%20Freedom%20Account,continues%20to%20be%20relatively%20low.
- <sup>19</sup> Ellie Bruecker, Assessing the Fiscal Impact of Wisconsin's Statewide Voucher Program, National Education Policy Center (October 2017), https://nepc.colorado.edu/sites/default/files/publications/PM%20Bruecker%20Funding 0.pdf.
- <sup>20</sup> David Ramsey, *New data on Ark. vouchers: More than 80% of new enrollees did not attend public school last year*, Arkansas Times (Oct. 31, 2017), <a href="https://arktimes.com/arkansas-blog/2024/10/31/new-data-on-ark-vouchers-more-than-80-of-new-enrollees-did-not-attend-public-school-last-year">https://arktimes.com/arkansas-blog/2024/10/31/new-data-on-ark-vouchers-more-than-80-of-new-enrollees-did-not-attend-public-school-last-year</a>.
- <sup>21</sup> Sadaf Knight, *Statement from Florida Policy Institute on Universal Voucher Program Data*, Florida Policy Institute (Sept. 14, 2023), https://www.floridapolicy.org/posts/statement-from-florida-policy-institute-on-universal-voucher-program-data.
- <sup>22</sup> Indiana Department of Education, *Choice Scholarship Program Annual Report, Participation & Payment 2023-2024*, https://www.in.gov/doe/files/2023-2024-Annual-Choice-Report.pdf.
- <sup>23</sup> See, e.g., Arkansas, Arizona, Florida, Iowa, New Hampshire, North Carolina, Ohio, Utah.
- <sup>24</sup> Use PFPS's private school dashboard to explore public and private school student enrollment nationally and in all 50 states and the District of Columbia. While the data represents all private school students, not only those who attended with publicly funded vouchers, the information shows how student enrollments may change when states implement or expand voucher programs and shines a light on the racial and economic inequities that are exacerbated by vouchers. <a href="https://pfps.org/private-school-dashboard.html">https://pfps.org/private-school-dashboard.html</a>.
- <sup>25</sup> Ty Rushing, *Kim Reynolds' Private School Voucher Plan Led to Tuition Hikes*, Iowa Starting Line (May 12, 2023), https://iowastartingline.com/2023/05/12/kim-reynolds-private-school-voucher-plan-led-to-tuition-hikes/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Dave Wells, \$10,700 Per Student: The Estimated Cost of Arizona's Private School Subsidy Program, Grand Canyon Institute (2018), <a href="https://grandcanyoninstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/">https://grandcanyoninstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/</a> GCI Policy Private School Program Costs 2018 Sept 5 2018.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Henry M. Levin & Cyrus E. Drive, *Cost of an Educational Voucher System*, 5(3) Educ. Econ. 265 (1997), https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09645299700000023.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Robert Shand & Henry M. Levin, *Estimating a Price Tag for School Vouchers*, National Education Policy Center (2021), https://nepc.colorado.edu/publication/voucher-costs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Henry M. Levin & Cyrus E. Drive, *Cost of an Educational Voucher System*, 5(3) Educ. Econ. 265 (1997), https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0964529970000023.

<sup>30</sup> See, e.g., Stuart S. Yeh, The Cost-Effectiveness of Five Policies for Improving Student Achievement, 28(4) Am. J. Evaluation 416 (2007), <a href="https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/1098214007307928">https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/1098214007307928</a>; Joanne Barkan, Death by a Thousand Cuts, Jacobin (June 13, 2018), <a href="https://jacobin.com/2018/06/us-public-schools-charters-vouchers-privatization">https://jacobin.com/2018/06/us-public-schools-charters-vouchers-privatization</a>.

Claims that "switchers," students who leave public schools to enroll in private schools using a voucher, save state and local governments money, have been debunked. See Luis Huerta and Steven J. Koutsavlis, NEPC Review: Fiscal Effects of School Choice: Analyzing the Costs and Savings of Private School Choice Programs in America (EdChoice, November 2021), National Education Policy Center (Mar. 15, 2022), <a href="https://nepc.colorado.edu/thinktank/fiscal-effects">https://nepc.colorado.edu/thinktank/fiscal-effects</a>. See the Economic Policy Institute's calculator that estimates the dollar costs to school districts from students leaving public schools with a voucher. The tool allows users to see how much money students who remain in public schools will lose out on, https://www.epi.org/publication/vouchers-harm-public-schools/.

<sup>31</sup> Luis Benveniste, Martin Carnoy & Richard Rothstein, *All Else Equal: Are Public and Private Schools Different?* (2013); Selene Almazan & Denise Stile Marshall, *School Vouchers and Students with Disabilities: Examining Impact in the Name of Choice,* Council of Parent Attorneys and Advocates (2016),

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.copaa.org/resource/resmgr/docs/Policy Docs/COPAA Voucher paper final R6.pdf.

- <sup>32</sup> Joseph Waddington, Ron Zimmer, & Mark Berends, *Cream Skimming and Pushout of Students Participating in Statewide Private School Voucher Program*, EdWorking Paper: 22-635, Annenberg Institute at Brown University (Aug. 2022), <a href="https://www.edworkingpapers.com/sites/default/files/ai22-635.pdf">https://www.edworkingpapers.com/sites/default/files/ai22-635.pdf</a>.
- <sup>33</sup> See, e.g., Ellie Bruecker, Assessing the Fiscal Impact of Wisconsin's Statewide Voucher Program, National Education Policy Center (2017), https://nepc.colorado.edu/sites/default/files/publications/PM%20 Bruecker%20Funding 0.pdf.
- <sup>34</sup> See, e.g., Ulrich Boser, Meg Benner & Erin Roth, Center for American Progress, *The Highly Negative Impacts of Vouchers* (2018), <a href="https://cdn.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2018/03/22115443/">https://cdn.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2018/03/22115443/</a> NegativeEffectsVouchers-report2.pdf; Jonathan Mills & Patrick Wolf, <a href="https://che.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2018/03/22115443/">https://che.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2018/03/22115443/</a> NegativeEffectsVouchers-report2.pdf;
- <sup>35</sup> Mary McKillip & Theresa Luhm, Investing Additional Resources in Schools Serving Low-Income Students, Education Law Center (April 2020), <a href="https://edlawcenter.org/assets/files/pdfs/publications/Investing">https://edlawcenter.org/assets/files/pdfs/publications/Investing</a> in Students Policy Bri.pdf; Education Law Center, Money Matters: Evidence Supporting Greater Investment in PK-12 Public Education Research Talking Points for Advocates (Mar. 2023), <a href="https://bit.ly/3mxwJ41">https://bit.ly/3mxwJ41</a>.
- <sup>36</sup> James J. Heckman & Dimitriy V. Masterov, *The Productivity Argument for Investing in Young Children*, 29(3) Rev. Agricultural Econ. 446 (2007), https://jenni.uchicago.edu/papers/Heckman Masterov RAE 2007 v29 n3.pdf.
- <sup>37</sup> William J. Mathis, *Research-Based Options for Education Policymaking: The Effectiveness of Class Size Reduction*, National Education Policy Center, School of Education, University of Colorado Boulder (July 2016), https://nepc.colorado.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Mathis%20RBOPM-9%20Class%20Size.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Jason Fontana & Jessica L. Jennings, *The Effect of Taxpayer-Funded Education Savings Account Vouchers on Private School Tuition: Evidence from Iowa*, EdWorkingPaper: 24-949, Annenberg Institute at Brown University (April 2024),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Neal Morton, *Arizona gave families public money for private schools. Then private schools raised tuition*, The Hechinger Report (Nov. 27, 2023), https://hechingerreport.org/arizona-gave-families-public-money-for-private-schools-then-private-schools-raised-tuition/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Public Schools First NC, *North Carolina's Taxpayer-Funded Vouchers & Private School Tuition Increases*, <a href="https://publicschoolsfirstnc.org/wp-content/uploads/2025/05/5.2025">https://publicschoolsfirstnc.org/wp-content/uploads/2025/05/5.2025</a> Taxpayer-Funded-Vouchers-and-Private-School-Tuition-Increases.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Heather Koons, *Private, Mostly Religious Schools in Rural NC Hike Tuition in Anticipation of Vouchers*, KTLA5 (June 25, 2024), <a href="https://ktla.com/business/press-releases/ein-presswire/722576857/private-mostly-religious-schools-in-rural-nc-hike-tuition-in-anticipation-of-vouchers/">https://ktla.com/business/press-releases/ein-presswire/722576857/private-mostly-religious-schools-in-rural-nc-hike-tuition-in-anticipation-of-vouchers/</a>.